Sacred Mandala of Wenara Wana: implementation model of sustainable tourism governance by monkey forest tourist attraction in Bali (Indonesia)

***La Mandala sacra de Wenara Wana: implementación de un modelo de gobernanza del turismo sostenible en la atracción turística del “Bosque de los Monos” de Bali (Indonesia)***

**Dewa Krisna** **Prasada[[1]](#footnote-1)**

**I Nyoman Nurjaya [[2]](#footnote-2)**

**Rachmi Sulistyarini [[3]](#footnote-3)**

**Muktiono Muktiono [[4]](#footnote-4)**

## Abstract:

Environmental damage control and cultural traditions are the main focus of sustainable tourism development. Padangtegal Traditional Village, with its Monkey Forest Ubud tourist attraction, is one of the traditional villages that can maximize its tourism potential and improve the economy of its customary law community. For this reason, this research will examine the management model of the Ubud Monkey Forest management model from the perspective of sustainable tourism. This research aims to determine sustainable tourism management procedures with Padangtegal Traditional Village as an example of ideal implementation. This research uses empirical legal research methods with socio- legal approaches, legislation, and legal facts. The technical analysis of this research uses descriptive and prescriptive analysis techniques. This study demonstrates that the Padangtegal Traditional Village effectively applies the Tri Hita Karana philosophy in the management of the Monkey Forest Ubud, thereby aligning with the principles of sustainable tourism implementation. In addition, Padangtegal Traditional Village is very professional in managing the Monkey Forest by involving academics and practitioners to work together to protect and preserve the customary forest and the animals that live there.

**Keywords**: Tourism, sustainability, indigenous villages, Wenara Wana, Bali, Indonesia.

**Resumen:**

El control de los daños ambientales y las tradiciones culturales son el foco principal del desarrollo del turismo sostenible. El pueblo tradicional de Padangtegal, con su atractivo turístico del Bosque de los Monos de Ubud, es uno de los pueblos tradicionales que puede maximizar su potencial turístico y mejorar la economía de su comunidad de derecho consuetudinario. Por esta razón, esta investigación examinará el modelo de gestión del Bosque de los Monos de Ubud desde la perspectiva del turismo sostenible. Esta investigación tiene como objetivo determinar los procedimientos de gestión del turismo sostenible con el pueblo tradicional de Padangtegal como ejemplo de implementación ideal. Esta investigación utiliza métodos de investigación jurídica empírica con enfoques socio-legales, legislación y estudios de caso jurídicos. El método de esta investigación utiliza técnicas de análisis descriptivo y prescriptivo. Este estudio demuestra que el pueblo tradicional de Padangtegal aplica eficazmente la filosofía Tri Hita Karana en la gestión del Bosque de los Monos de Ubud, alineándose así con los principios de la implementación del turismo sostenible. Además, el pueblo tradicional de Padangtegal es muy profesional en la gestión del Bosque de los Monos al involucrar a académicos y profesionales para trabajar juntos para proteger y preservar el bosque consuetudinario y los animales que viven allí.

**Palabras clave:** Turismo, sostenibilidad, pueblos indígenas, Wenara Wana, Bali, Indonesia.

# Introduction

The 1980 UNWTO-WTC meeting held in Manila concerned international harmonization and the promotion of human rights. The event was attended by 107 delegates representing various countries and 91 observers from the tourism sector. This significant turnout serves to underscore the crucial role that tourism plays in the context of international development. "*…, to clarify the real nature of tourism in all its aspects."* (UNMTO, 1980). The conference's primary object is to ascertain the essence of global tourism, with the aspiration that tourism will exert a positive transformative impact on the worldwide economy in the forthcoming years. Tourism is widely seen as a catalyst for promoting global peace, fostering moral and intellectual enlightenment within the international community, and facilitating the development of sustainable cooperation among nations.

The impact of tourism on global business is widely seen as a catalyst for a new economic cycle, with the potential to reduce disparities between developed and developing countries. The concept of sustainable tourism plays a significant role in guaranteeing the stability of economic and social progress within the tourism sector. Sustainable tourism can be elucidated by referring to the definition of tourism provided in Article 1 of the UNWTO-WTC Manila, which characterizes it as an endeavor that pertains to the various aspects of life within a country, including its economic, cultural, and educational sectors6. The laws above clearly explain the direct correlation between the tourism development industry and a nation's social and economic progress. The United Nations World Tourism Organisation (UNWTO) provides an official statement on its website outlining the concept and principles of sustainable tourism. "*Tourism that takes full account of its current and future economic, social, and environmental impacts, addressing the needs of visitors, the industry, the environment and host communities*"7.

The significance of the environment and local communities in the tourism sector cannot be disregarded. This observation can be derived from the elucidation above of sustainable tourism provided by the United Nations World Tourism Organisation (UNWTO). Furthermore, it should be noted that the Global Code of Ethics for Tourism, endorsed by the United Nations World Tourism Organisation (UNWTO-GCET), emphasizes the responsibility of tourism operations to safeguard the environment and promote sustainable economic development for long-term prosperity8. According to Moh Fadli, sustainable tourism underscores the importance of addressing environmental factors to protect natural resources and ecosystems and mitigate potential ecological harm within tourism management9.

Sustainable tourism is currently a significant concern in various countries, including Indonesia. Indonesia perceives tourism as a multifaceted and interdisciplinary endeavor that caters to the many requirements of individuals and nations. In this context, tourism serves as a platform for the interaction between tourists, local communities, government entities, and entrepreneurs. The provision in question can be found in Article 1, Section 4 of Law No. 10 of 2009, which pertains to regulating tourism activities10. Indonesia emphasizes sustainability in its tourism law, as outlined in Article 2 letter h. A comprehensive and interdisciplinary comprehension of tourism underpins this principle11. The tourist sector in Indonesia plays a crucial role in ensuring the country's economic stability. This assertion is supported by Indonesia's Gross Domestic Product (GDP) growth rate of 4.8%. Furthermore, according to the most recent data available in 2019, the tourist sector significantly contributed 15.4% to the country's foreign exchange earnings12. The significant contribution of Bali Province as a globally recognized symbol of Indonesian tourism is crucial to understanding the 15.4% foreign exchange number in the tourism industry in Indonesia.

Bali Province, situated inside the Indonesian archipelago, encompasses a land area of 5,634.40 square kilometers and boasts a coastline spanning 529 kilometers. This region has emerged as a prominent tourism destination, serving as an iconic representation of Indonesia's tourism industry. The Bali Province encompasses eight regencies and one municipality, accommodating an approximate population of 4,230,051 individuals13. Among the 8 regencies and 1 city, one region stands out as a popular tourist destination for international visitors. This region is the Padangtegal Traditional Village, located in Gianyar Regency. The village boasts a prominent tourist attraction called the Mandala Suci Wenara Wana customary forest, colloquially called the Monkey Forest. This unique forest is home to a diverse population of monkeys, which coexist harmoniously with the local Padangtegal customary law community. Implementing the Tri Hita Karana (THK) ideology has rendered Ubud Monkey Forest a significant conservation forest in the Gianyar Regency, particularly within the Ubud sub-district of Bali. The administration of the Monkey Forest tourist attraction places considerable emphasis on preserving cultural and natural aspects. The Monkey Forest Ubud, also known as Mandala Suci Wenara Wana, is presently recognized as a sacred forest area diligently protected by the local indigenous community.

Additionally, it serves as a destination for tourists who seek to admire and contribute to the conservation efforts of the forest and its resident animal population14. This research will, therefore, focus on the existing form of sustainable tourism governance in Monkey Forest Ubud. Based on the explanation above, the formulation of the problem can be drawn as follows: How is the governance model of the Monkey Forest Ubud tourist attraction viewed from the perspective of sustainable principles in positive law in Indonesia?

The Monkey Forest is regarded as a prominent tourist destination that plays a significant role in fostering economic growth and enhancing the well-being of local communities. In their research titled "The Contribution of Monkey Forest Tourist Attraction in Enhancing the Welfare of the Local Community in Padang Tegal Village, Ubud District, in 2014," I Wayan Restu Suarmana and I Gst Agun Oka Mahagangga found that the indigenous community of Padangtegal has experienced positive benefits in terms of economic value in their lives as a result of the practical and sustainable management of the Monkey Forest attraction. In addition to its financial considerations, the Monkey Forest tourist attraction focuses on the socio-religious factors within the vicinity of the tourist site. In their 2016 study titled "Waste Management at Wanara Wana / Monkey Forest Tourist Attraction, Padangtegal Village, Ubud," Ida Ayu Suarinastuti and I Gst Agung Oka Mahagangga highlight the diligent efforts of the Monkey Forest tourist attraction's management in safeguarding the environment through the effective management of both organic and non-organic waste. The Monkey Forest tourist destination region is well protected against environmental degradation, notably waste pollution, with the active involvement and endorsement of the Padangtegal indigenous people16. In conjunction with trash management, the Padangtegal Customary Village, as the overseer of the Monkey Forest, demonstrates concern for the habitat of macaque animals residing within the customary forest. The customary village is focused on maintaining the population stability of macaques. In their 2022 research titled "The Implementation of Mandala Suci Wenara Wana Tourism Object Management by Padangtegal Traditional Village, Ubud District, Gianyar Regency," Ni Komang Ayu Sri Widiari and colleagues highlight the necessity of addressing the macaque population in the Monkey Forest tourist destination area. The researchers argue that the presence of macaques has been perceived as disruptive to the local community in the present circumstances. However, it is essential to note that the company of these monkeys holds significant value for indigenous populations, as it is a notable tourist attraction within the region. On the other hand, the presence of these monkeys is conducive to indigenous people because it is a tourist attraction in the area, which impacts local community businesses in Padangtegal Traditional Village.

This research parallels the study conducted at the Mandala Suci Wenara Wana (Monkey Forest) tourist attraction in the Padangtegal Traditional Village, Ubud, Gianyar, Bali, as described above. This study will primarily examine the administration of sustainable tourism in Indonesia, specifically focusing on the legal framework and the incorporation of Balinese traditional knowledge, particularly the THK idea. Furthermore, this study will also assess the efficacy of the sustainability principle in the Monkey Forest Ubud tourism destination.

# Method

The primary objective of this study will be to examine empirical legal research. The methodologies employed encompass socio-legal approaches, legislative measures, and legal facts. Furthermore, this study will use analytical and prescriptive descriptive techniques to assess the data.

# Result

## Tourist attraction of Sacred Mandala of *Wenara Wana* (Monkey Forest)

The site commonly referred to as Monkey Forest Ubud, formally called Mandala Suci Wenara Wana, Ubud, holds a prominent position as a compulsory tourist destination for both domestic and international visitors to comprehend the Monkey Forest tourist attraction. It is imperative to acquaint oneself with its geographical location. The Monkey Forest is in the Gianyar Regency, comprising seven distinct districts: Sukawati, Blahbatuh, Gianyar, Tampaksiring, Ubud, Tegallalang, and Payangan18. The Monkey Forest is specifically situated in the traditional village of Adat Padangtegal, in the district of Ubud. The Padangtegal Traditional Village, with an area of 1.28 square kilometers, has a population of 3,03419. Initially, the predominant occupation within the Padangtegal customary law society consisted of individuals engaged in agricultural and artistic pursuits. In the present era, the Padangtegal customary law society has shifted its attention towards the tourism service industry due to the growing demand for tourism in Ubud20. The Padangtegal Traditional Village comprises four distinct traditional banjars: Banjar Kaja, Banjar Kelod, and Banjar Padang Kencana.

The Monkey Forest Ubud tourism attraction originated in 1986 when the Padangtegal Indigenous peoples established it. The Padangtegal customary law community recognized the potential for tourism in the 12.5 hectares customary forest area of the Padangtegal Customary Village. They constructed a Monkey Forest tourist attraction to enhance the economic well-being of the indigenous people of Padangtegal (Gianyar, 2023). The Regional Government of Gianyar Regency initially offered to assume control of the Monkey Forest tourist attraction operation. The Padangtegal customary law community demonstrates a solid dedication to preserving its autonomy in administering the Monkey Forest tourist.

The commitment of the indigenous community of Padangtegal has led to the Monkey Forest attraction becoming a prominent tourist destination for individuals seeking direct engagement with nature and monkey species. It has also emerged as a significant site for the conservation of apes. Furthermore, the Padangtegal Traditional Village is actively engaged in forest conservation by implementing tree-planting initiatives to expand the existing forest area, which currently spans 26 hectares.

The Monkey Forest tourist attraction within the Padangtegal Traditional Village has significantly contributed to the traditional village in various aspects. These contributions encompass economic benefits derived from entrance ticket sales and parking fees, employment opportunities for local residents, cultural preservation efforts, and advancements in the health sector. From an economic perspective, the revenue generated from entrance tickets and parking fees is effectively utilized for the welfare of indigenous peoples (*krama desa adat*). Nevertheless, the Padangtegal Traditional Village contributes financially to the Regional Government of Gianyar Regency by paying taxes on various establishments such as hotels, restaurants, and entertainment venues, including the renowned Monkey Forest tourist destination. Furthermore, the allocation of parking fees is distributed between the local administration and the traditional village. The Monkey Forest tourist attraction makes a significant cultural contribution by offering training opportunities to enhance artistic skills, particularly in painting, a specialization among most of the indigenous people of Padangtegal.

Contributions from the health aspect, where from the Monkey Forest tourist attraction profit levy, Padangtegal Traditional Village has a health clinic, and one of the Padangtegal Traditional Village health programs is to provide health assistance for older people. The person in charge of the traditional village called Baga Pawongan carries out health assistance activities. Health assistance is carried out through health checks, drug/vitamin assistance, and assistance for health equipment for older people, such as diapers and wheelchairs, if needed.

**Figure 1.** Art Painting Training in Padangtegal Traditional Village to Traditional Village Residents

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  |  |

Source: Authors

Contributions from the health aspect, where from the Monkey Forest tourist attraction profit levy, Padangtegal Traditional Village has a health clinic, and one of the Padangtegal Traditional Village health programs is to provide health assistance for older people. The person in charge of the traditional village called *Baga Pawongan* carries out health assistance activities. Health assistance is carried out through health checks, drug/vitamin assistance, and assistance for health equipment for older people, such as diapers and wheelchairs, if needed.

**Figure 2.** Health assistance to older people provided by Baga Pawongan Padangtegal Traditional Village

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  |  |
|  |  |

Source: Authors

The Monkey Forest additionally supports the Padangtegal indigenous population in preserving their well-being by providing a soccer field made available for use by the people of the Padangtegal indigenous group.

**Figure 3.** Football field facilities for Padangtegal Traditional Village residents around the Monkey Forest Tourism Destination area



Source: Authors

Based on the explanation above, the Monkey Forest Ubud tourism attraction in Padangtegal Traditional Village has a beneficial influence. It significantly contributes to the local customary law community, particularly regarding economic development, cultural conservation, and public health. Furthermore, the Monkey Forest tourist attraction serves as a means by which the Padangtegal Traditional Village exercises indirect control over the environment, particularly concerning preserving customary woods and the fauna inhabiting them.

## Governance Model of Wenara Wana Sacred Mandala Tourist Attraction (Monkey Forest)

The Monkey Forest tourist attraction adheres to the governance principles outlined in the Bali Province Regional Regulation Number 5 of 2020, specifically addressing the standards for managing Balinese cultural tourism (SPKBB). In the management realm, it is noteworthy that Monkey Forest is effectively governed by the Monkey Forest management, operating autonomously within the Padangtegal Traditional Village.

The Padangtegal Customary Village has a primary and essential motive to uphold the autonomy of Monkey Forest management. This motive is rooted in the village's commitment to conserving and safeguarding the customary forest and its resident monkey population. The legal authority over the forest by Padangtegal Customary Village is substantiated by the presence of Pura Beji and Pura Dalem (*parahyangan*), which have been revered by the indigenous peoples of Padangtegal from ancient times. The management of Monkey Forest Ubud is effectively overseen by the Padangtegal Traditional Village, which implements professional practices to generate revenue through tourist attractions, parking facilities, and other business ventures such as shop rentals. These profits are utilized exclusively for the well-being of the indigenous community (krama desa), encompassing both physical and mental aspects. The allocation of these resources is distributed across three key domains: *parahyangan* (religion), *palemahan* (environment), and the residents of Padangtegal Traditional Village (*pawongan*). Furthermore, the Padangtegal Traditional Village has partnered with the Transportation Department of Gianyar Regency to enhance the illumination infrastructure surrounding the Monkey Forest tourism attraction site.

The motivation underlying the efforts of Padangtegal Customary Village and its residents to save the customary forest is rooted in their adherence to the THK concept. The Padangtegal customary law community demonstrates a profound commitment to safeguarding the customary forest within its jurisdiction, driven by a deep-seated connection to the concepts of *pawongan* (humanity) and *parahyangan* (the divine). The primary emphasis of Padangtegal Customary Village in overseeing the Monkey Forest tourist attraction is not solely centered on marketing endeavors. Instead, the principal concentration lies in the proficient and responsible management of the customary forest and its resident fauna. According to Bendesa Adat, the leader of Padangtegal Customary Village, a customary law known as *awig-awig* governs the preservation and administration of customary forests. To ensure the long-term sustainability of these forests, a customary law has been established to regulate the allocation of forest zones. The initial zone is the 0% zone, denoting that the forested region encompasses a temple, signifying the prohibition of any new structures apart from those designated for temple purposes. The 30% zone refers to a designated woodland area that permits the construction of additional buildings limited to 30% of the total area. The final location, including 40% of the territory, is designated for constructing facility buildings to enhance tourism activities within the Ubud Monkey Forest.

According to the statement of I Made Parmita, the Customary Village Head, the original size of the customary forest was 12.5 hectares. However, it was expanded to 26 hectares within the designated 40% zone. During the implementation of the 40% zone, several amenities and infrastructure were constructed, including the expansion of a parking lot. Padangtegal Traditional Village, as the proprietor and administrator of Monkey Forest Ubud, demonstrates a high level of professionalism by effectively managing all village assets. One notable aspect of this professionalism is implementing a comprehensive plan for Padangtegal Traditional Village, which includes a decentralized program for managing village assets. One example of decentralization is observed at the Monkey Forest tourist attraction, wherein an independent management structure is implemented.

Furthermore, the Padang Tegal Traditional Village intends to establish non-tourism- related commercial entities to preserve customary woodlands and the inhabited monkey population. This phenomenon is evident in the COVID-19 pandemic, wherein the local community faced challenges protecting the forest and its primate population. These difficulties directly resulted from the decline in tourist visits during the widespread outbreak of COVID-19. Hence, the comprehensive strategy devised by the Padangtegal Traditional Village aims to effectively manage both the economic and social domains within the traditional village.

The Padangtegal Traditional Village effectively oversees the management of the Monkey Forest Ubud tourist attraction while prioritizing the maintenance of a hygienic and environmentally sound surrounding area. The Padangtegal Traditional Village has implemented a compost house and enhanced the utilization of the Integrated Waste Management Site (TPST) established by the Regional Government of Gianyar Regency. The Padangtegal Customary Village has implemented a garbage subsidy scheme for its people, contingent upon the prerequisite that each member of the customary village autonomously sorts their household waste before availing the reimbursement. One potential consequence for failing to sort waste independently is the social repercussion of not receiving waste collection services from the traditional village waste manager28. Furthermore, the Padangtegal Customary Village has implemented customary regulations to preserve a pristine environment surrounding the Monkey Forest tourist attraction. These regulations mandate that all tourism establishments, including restaurants and hotels within the customary village vicinity, particularly those close to the customary forest, must partake in the compost house program by paying a designated fee.

Indigenous peoples of Padangtegal are granted priority rights to participate in managing the Monkey Forest tourist attraction. The indigenous people from Padangtegal Traditional Village are employed by various personnel within the organization, ranging from the director to the general staff. Parmita expressly said that the majority (99%) of the workforce at Monkey Forest Ubud are indigenous peoples from Padangtegal Traditional Village. Nevertheless, the customary village engages in outsourcing for the cleaning service and security department.

Collaboration between Padangtegal Traditional Village and the Primate of Udaya University. The primary objective of this collaborative initiative is to ensure the preservation of the macaque environment within the Ubud Monkey Forest while concurrently striving to maintain a stable macaque population. The expression of concern exhibited by the Padangtegal Customary Village represents a manifestation of the harmonious coexistence between the Padangtegal customary law community and the monkey population, which is held in high regard and esteemed by the community above. During the COVID-19 pandemic, indigenous villagers exhibited heightened worry by reserving food from their prayers to ensure enough food supply for monkeys residing in their communities.

To uphold the standard of tourism services at Monkey Forest Ubud, the management of Monkey Forest and Padangtegal Traditional Village have implemented a strategy to provide financial support for hospitality training to local residents who will be employed as staff members at the Monkey Forest Ubud tourist attraction. The Monkey Forest management intends to present this program during a customary gathering called a "*paruman adat*."

One of the most significant investments of Padangtegal Traditional Village is to expand the customary forest and create green open spaces30. The process of forest expansion involves allocating resources towards acquiring mature trees, which are subsequently transplanted inside the forested regions spanning from the 0% to the 40% zone. The primary objective of forest preservation is to uphold environmental harmony and ensure its long-term health and sustainability, as elucidated by the administration of Monkey Forest Ubud. "Maintaining harmony among nature, the cosmos, and human beings necessitates carefully managing their interconnected activities. Ritualistic acts of making offerings and prayers are conducted to venerate ancestral spirits and deities. However, it is worth noting that the Pemangku and the neighboring people make offerings and conduct prayers to the spirits residing within the trees and statues in the Monkey Forest".

**Figure 4.** Hutan Adat Mandala Suci *Wanare Wana* Monkey Forest Ubud



Source: Authors

The above explanation indicates that if harassment occurs in the customary forest area, including the temple, the Padangtegal Customary Village will perform a holy ritual (*pecaruan*) to restore balance to the forest, considered sacred by the Padangtegal customary law.

# Research Discussion

* 1. **Sustainable Tourism in the Governance of the Sacred *Mandala* of *Wenara Wana***

## (Monkey Forest Ubud)

Sustainable tourism primarily emphasizes three key dimensions: economic, ecological, and socio-cultural. Incorporating sustainable principles in the tourism business makes it highly suitable for managing and mitigating adverse impacts on the natural environment, hence preventing environmental degradation. According to Fadli et al., sustainable tourism places significant emphasis on the present and future economic, social, and environmental conditions to fulfil the requirements of the tourism sector, the natural environment, and local communities. The ultimate objective is to establish a robust and advantageous tourism industry (Moh Fadli et.al**.,** 2022).

Article 8 of the Manila Declaration in World Tourism underscores the imperative for countries to refrain from exclusively relying on the financial gains derived from the tourism sector while acknowledging such revenues' tangible and optimistic nature. Due to this rationale, the convention articulates explicitly that: "The provision of holiday entitlements serves as a means to foster citizens' acquaintance with their local surroundings, enhance their understanding of national identity, promote solidarity among fellow compatriots, and cultivate a sense of cultural and societal belonging. These significant factors contribute to the encouragement of individual engagement in both domestic and international tourism, thereby facilitating access to leisure and travel opportunities (UNWTO, 1980).

The previously mentioned declaration explicitly establishes a constraint within the tourist sector, asserting that economic considerations alone are insufficient for effective and appropriate tourism management. Nevertheless, it is imperative to prioritize the local community as the host for tourism initiatives to foster a deeper understanding and appreciation of the natural environment, local knowledge, cultural practices, and traditional customs. This approach is crucial for cultivating a sense of attachment and responsibility toward preserving and sustaining the designated or existing tourism destination.

Article 3, section 1 of the Global Tourist Code of Ethics imposes certain restrictions on executing sustainable tourism practices. The clause mandates that all stakeholders involved in tourism development must make diligent efforts to safeguard the natural environment, aiming to foster a robust and enduring economic prosperity that is environmentally sustainable34. As instructed by the United Nations World Tourism Organization (UNWTO, 1980)), the primary objective of implementing sustainable tourism is to enhance societal well-being and equitably address the requirements of both present and future generations. Section 2 offers a comprehensive examination of a tourism development model that prioritizes environmental sustainability, aiming to conserve natural resources and minimize the generation of tourism trash, thus mitigating any adverse effects on biological pollutants. This section emphasizes the need to grant priority rights to local communities and central and regional governments in formulating regulations for managing the natural environment, as stated in the second paragraph. Point 3 underscores the importance of regulating tourism operations to prevent any harm to the natural environment while emphasizing the need for the tourism industry to contribute positively to the economic well-being of local communities.

The tourist development in Indonesia is determined following the principle of sustainability, as stated in Article 2 letter h of the tourism law. According to Article 4 letters a, b, and e of the tourist law, the tourism sector in Indonesia has incorporated the notion of sustainability into its organizational goals. The sustainable principle is achieved through a dual focus on promoting economic growth and enhancing individuals' well- being while maintaining the natural environment and resources35. An explanation of sustainability principles can be found in Article 5, specifically in letters b, c, and d, when viewed through the lens of organized tourism. The concepts above are intricately connected to preserving human rights, cultural diversity, and indigenous knowledge within a socio-cultural context. The economic dimension is encompassed within the values of societal well-being, justice, equality, and proportionality. The premise of sustaining the sustainability of nature and the environment includes the concept of ecology. Furthermore, Article 6 of the tourist development regulations in Indonesia stipulates that the realization of tourism development should prioritize preserving and promoting the diverse, unique, and distinctive aspects of culture and nature. It should also cater to the travel requirements and desires of individuals.

The tourism law is not the sole regulatory framework that supports the implementation of sustainable tourism practices. The Government of the Republic of Indonesia pursued the sustainable tourism development initiative through the ratification of Minister of Tourism and Creative Economy Regulation Number 9 of 2021. This regulation pertains to the criteria for sustainable tourism destinations, commonly referred to as the Permenparkraf rules. Paragraph (1) of Article 2 delineates the standards for sustainable tourism destinations, encompassing social, economic, cultural, and environmental sustainability (Peraturan Menteri Pairiwsata dan Ekonomi Kreatif. Indonesia, 2021). The Ministry of Tourism guidelines These criteria apply to diverse places, including urban, rural, mountainous, coastal, or a mix thereof. The requirements can be observed in macro- and micro-level destinations." Large scale" describes substantial urban areas, regions, districts, resorts, and similar entities. Sustainable tourism destinations can be implemented in various contexts, such as national parks, small groups, tourist villages, local communities, and similar entities, albeit on a smaller scale.

Sustainable tourism is a crucial component of a country's development strategy, characterized by a systematic and integrated approach that prioritizes long-term viability. It also entails a sense of duty towards safeguarding religious beliefs cultural traditions, and preserving the natural environment within the society. According to Nyoman Nurjaya, it is imperative to foster the growth of the tourism sector to promote a fair allocation of entrepreneurial prospects and employment chances. The primary objective of national sustainable tourism development is to improve the overall welfare of individuals while ensuring the long-term ecological sustainability of the natural environment and preserving the cultural heritage of local communities (I Nyoman Nurjaya, 2022).

Regarding the subject of this research, the tourist attraction of Monkey Forest holds a primary claim by the Adat Village of Padangtegal as the sole manager of said tourist attraction, which is also considered part of their customary forest. It can be observed that Desa Adat Padangtegal is using all the potential within its customary territory in the development of tourism, thereby indirectly exercising its autonomous authority to the fullest extent as a self-governing community. Hal ini dapat dijelaskan oleh pemahaman yang dimiliki oleh Desa Adat Padangtegal terhadap kedudukannya yang memiliki otonomi sah dalam pengelolaan desa adatnya. As elucidated by Moh Fadli et al., it is understood that a village possesses a form of local governance characterized by autonomy, sometimes called local self-government. The concept of indigenous village autonomy encompasses the traditional autonomy derived from the right of origin and the autonomy to govern their own domestic affairs and village resources. The authority to regulate and manage governance, local community interests, rights of origin, and traditional rights recognized by the State of Indonesia is explicitly stated in Article 1 number 1 of Law Number 6 of 2014 concerning Villages. These villages, also known as indigenous villages, possess the power to govern and address the needs of their local communities through community-driven initiatives(Undang Undang, 2014).

The Padangtegal Traditional Village has effectively implemented sustainable tourism practices to manage its tourist attractions. From an economic perspective, the Monkey Forest Ubud, under the complete management of the Padangtegal Traditional Village, offers job opportunities to its local residents. Additionally, it grants preferential rights as a business entity near tourist attractions. Padangtegal Traditional Village effectively manages the allocation of profits generated from the Monkey Forest Ubud attraction by implementing a professional projection budgeting system. These profits are exclusively dedicated to the welfare of the indigenous villagers (krama desa). They are utilized to support various aspects of their community, including *parahyangan* (religious ceremonies), *palemahan* (maintenance of a healthy living environment), and *pawongan* (enhancement of the villagers' well-being). In addition to its proficient budget management practices, Padangtegal Traditional Village boasts a clinic that primarily caters to the needs of the local indigenous population, with a particular emphasis on the older demographic. As elucidated in the preceding subsection, within the forthcoming comprehensive strategy, the village endeavors to establish non-tourism commercial entities to enhance its economy, particularly regarding the well-being of its customary law community.

Concerning ecological sustainability, the Padangtegal Customary Village implements various initiatives, including the compost house program, to safeguard the natural environment, particularly within the customary forest vicinity. Guided by the THK philosophy, the village actively preserves the customary forest and ensures the well-being of the monkey population. In addition to adhering to the forest environment protection measures and zone regulations discussed in the preceding sub-chapter, the customary village also allocates resources towards tree planting initiatives to expand its customary forest territory. In conjunction with the village krama (residents), the customary village serves as a safeguard for the temple, which holds significant cultural and spiritual importance within the local customary law community. This arrangement is aimed at preserving the equilibrium of the customary village. The Padangtegal customary law community believes that the temple located within the forest plays a crucial role in maintaining the equilibrium and long-term viability of the customary forest, alongside its natural environment and resident fauna. Padangtegal Customary Village is committed to safeguarding the temples within the forested area. Moh. Fadli and colleagues assert that the unity of crucial values plays a significant role in preserving religious sites, particularly temples, as an integral aspect of sustainable tourism40. Moreover, it has been elucidated that the temple's preservation necessitates a legally binding document encompassing ethical, religious, and sustainable tourism principles. These above components play a pivotal role in upholding the temple's significance as a testament to religious and cultural values, ensuring its enduring legacy for forthcoming generations.

Cultural sustainability is an integral component inseparable from the tourism sector in Bali, particularly with the Monkey Forest Ubud tourist destination. The primary objective of Padangtegal Traditional Village is to offer art instruction, with a particular emphasis on painting, to children. This initiative aims to preserve the cultural practices and distinctive features that have long been ingrained in the fabric of Padangtegal Traditional Village. Furthermore, as part of its cultural preservation efforts, the Monkey Forest Ubud tourist attraction features regular performances of traditional Balinese dances such as the *Lubdhaka* Dance and the Frog Dance. These performances allow tourists to observe one of the cultural practices of the Padangtegal traditional community, specifically the Pitra Yadnya ceremony, commonly called *ngaben*, associated with death rituals.

Under the management of Padangtegal Traditional Village, the tourism industry has played a significant role in implementing sustainable tourism practices. Furthermore, through the proficient execution of implementation and the endorsement of the local customary law community, the Monkey Forest Ubud tourist attraction has emerged as a compulsory destination for all tourists, thus facilitating the well-being of the customary law community through effective and sustainable tourism management practices. Hence, Padangtegal Traditional Village must serve as an exemplary paradigm for implementing sustainable tourism.

## The Concept of *Tri Hita* Karana in The Context of Sustainable Tourism

The presence of rules that contain the principles of law, including justice, certainty, and expediency, is crucial for achieving success in executing tourism initiatives. Nevertheless, comprehensive provisions are required to safeguard the primary entitlements of indigenous communities, preserve the ecological system, and preserve religious and cultural principles. According to the research conducted by Moh Fadli, it is imperative to establish a harmonious relationship between religious (spiritual), ethical, and sustainable tourism to protect and effectively manage the tourism industry. This approach holds significant advantages for various components within the industry, including the preservation of natural resources, cultural heritage, and the structural integrity of ancient buildings such as temples.

The Bali Province in Indonesia is renowned for its rich cultural heritage and religious practices. In its legislative framework, such as the Regional Regulation of Bali Province Number 5 of 2020 on Standards for the Implementation of Balinese Cultural Tourism (SPKBB), there is a deliberate incorporation of philosophical elements exemplified by the THK philosophy. Within Article 1, specifically in sections 9 and 10, two distinct ideologies, namely Sad Kerthi and THK, serve as the foundational principles for the organization and management of tourism in Bali43. 2 The idea mentioned earlier serves as a fundamental principle that must be advocated by any entity involved in the organization of tourism. However, the present study aims to investigate one particular philosophy in the context of sustainable tourism, namely THK.

According to the regulations outlined in the SPKBB regulation, THK is defined as the triad of factors contributing to happiness. THK entails maintaining a balanced and harmonious life attitude encompassing devotion to God, service to fellow human beings, and a sense of responsibility toward preserving the natural environment. These principles are rooted in the Hindu holy sacrifice ceremony known as *yadnya*44. According to Article 1 point 12, incorporating Balinese cultural tourism should be infused with the THK philosophy, which is rooted in Bali's indigenous knowledge and wisdom. According to Article 2, Letter B, the standards for conducting Balinese cultural tourism are explicitly defined as incorporating sustainability, which should be infused with the THK philosophy rooted in local wisdom. The Province of Bali protects and preserves the natural environment and Balinese culture. Regulation above is achieved by adopting sustainable tourism practices deeply rooted in the THK concept, as outlined in Article 3, paragraph (2).

THK refers to a Hindu philosophical framework that is grounded in theological concepts. THK originated from the intellectual efforts of Bali's local ancestors, who engaged in critical and comprehensive analysis to adapt Hindu teachings to Bali's societal and environmental circumstances. This intellectual process involved the categorization of *Parahyangan, Pawonggan*, and *Palemahan* as divisions within THK45. The presence of THK philosophy is intrinsically linked to the significant influence of the Bhagavad Gita, one of the prominent Hindu Scriptures. In Chapter 3.10 of the Bhagavad Gita, an ancient Hindu scripture, the author elucidates the sources of inspiration for THK, which include Prajapati, representing the divine entity in the role of the supreme ruler of all sentient beings, Praja, signifying the human populace, and Kamadhuk, symbolizing the entirety of the cosmos.

“*saha-yajnah prajah srstva purovaca prajapatih anena prasavisyadvam esa vo stva ista-kama-dhuk”*

The verse above can be interpreted as follows:

"During the initial stages of creation, the supreme deity (referred to as Prajatih) dispatched both human and divine beings, accompanied by sacred offerings, to Visnu. These beings were bestowed with blessings, as the deity expressed the desire for them to find contentment through the performance of the yajna (a ceremonial act of offering). It was believed that this yajna would grant them all that is sought after to lead a joyful life and attain liberation"46.

The concept of THK is rooted in Hindu *Tattva*, a philosophical framework that contains a perspective on life consisting of three fundamental aspects: *Parahyangan, Pawongan, and Palemahan*. These elements are said to be vital in fostering a state of tranquillity and harmony. According to Wayan P. Windia, the aforementioned tripartite harmony contains the interplay of three key components: the harmonious connection between individuals and *Hyang Widhi* (the divine being), the harmonious coexistence between individuals and their social milieu, and the harmonious link between individuals and the natural surroundings (Windia, W., uad. According to the THK perspective on life, incorporating THK principles is evident in several aspects of community life, particularly in religious ceremonies. Moreover, the THK concept of life has become a fundamental value in the regional development of Bali, namely in the advancement of Balinese cultural tourism.

The sustainable tourism sector is a crucial component that should be embraced by the THK concept, as elucidated in the introductory paragraph. THK lessons are an obligatory component within the framework of tourist development in Bali. The objective is to mitigate the potential exploitation of capitalist principles in executing tourism practices in Bali. According to the research conducted by Peters and Wardana, the significant size of the tourism sector in Bali necessitates implementing the THK program.

This program aims to foster the development of an ecologically sustainable tourism industry closely intertwined with the socio-cultural aspects of *palemahan*, *pawongan*, and *parahyangan*. The primary objective of this program is to mitigate exploitative, individualistic, and materialistic tendencies within the tourism sector in Bali48. Tourism management should prioritize the fundamental concepts of THK, which encompass harmonization, togetherness, balance, and sustainability. Sustainable tourism in Bali prioritizes the prevention of harm to the natural environment and upholds the rights of indigenous peoples, as highlighted by the principles above.

The Padangtegal Traditional Village is a local community that exemplifies implementing the Traditional, Historical, and Cultural (THK) concept, particularly in administering the Monkey Forest Ubud tourist destination. In contemporary traditional villages, a significant emphasis is placed on achieving harmony through carefully organizing *palemahan* or the surrounding environment. The practical use of the THK concept is accomplished by expanding the customary forest and establishing ample green open spaces. This concept was already discussed in the preceding sub-chapter. Applying the THK philosophy in managing the Monkey Forest Ubud tourist attraction involves consistently implementing sacred Hindu rituals associated with monkey animals in the Customary Forest. These rituals include the *Tumpek Kandang* and *Tumpek Uduh* (*parahyangan*) ceremonies. The primary objective of this ritual is to pay homage to the fauna and flora of the designated forest region, encompassing both animals and various species of trees and plants. The Padangtegal Traditional Village in Ubud Monkey Forest has incorporated the practice of various religious traditions, which has become a notable tourist destination. The Padangtegal Traditional Village plays a significant role in enhancing the well-being of its residents through various means. Firstly, it provides financial aid for ceremonial expenses, supporting the community's religious and cultural practices. Additionally, the village actively promotes economic growth by creating employment opportunities. Moreover, it facilitates the establishment of businesses, primarily in the tourism sector, for the indigenous villagers, thereby fostering entrepreneurship and economic development within the community.

## The Concept of Sustainable Tourism As A Means For Protecting The Rights Of Indigenous Peoples

Sustainable tourism primarily centers on the management and preservation of the natural environment. In addition to environmental considerations, sustainable tourism development also encompasses the welfare of marginalized communities, specifically indigenous peoples. According to Nyoman Nurjaya, the notion of sustainable tourism strongly correlates with the concept of community-based development. The primary focus of community-based development is to acknowledge and safeguard the community's economic, social, and cultural rights, enabling their active participation in development management. The overarching objective is to enhance the community's quality of life, promote social well-being, conserve the natural environment, and preserve

In sustainable tourism, community-based development must be accompanied by government rules that establish legal frameworks ensuring the appropriate utilization of tourism resources while safeguarding the interests of indigenous communities. Effective governance, regulatory frameworks, and assessment tools are essential for planning and managing sustainable tourism growth (Graham Miller and Anna Torres-Delgado, 2023) .

Indigenous peoples, within the context of tourism, are often characterized as economically disadvantaged and socially excluded within the global economy and social hierarchy. The tourist sector presents itself as a potential avenue for enhancing the well- being of indigenous communities. Pro-poor tourism is a guiding principle within the tourism sector that prioritizes indigenous peoples' rights. The notion of pro-poor tourism, in its essence, offers a conceptual framework for the advancement of the tourism sector, with a specific focus on fostering economic growth that is inclusive and advantageous for underprivileged populations. Following Article 19, paragraph (2) of the Indonesian legislation, there is a provision that aims to enhance the economic conditions of the local community by granting them preferential rights concerning tourism destination regions. These rights encompass opportunities for community members to engage in various roles within the tourism sector, including employment as workers, entrepreneurship, or managerial positions.

Nevertheless, the above regulations remain ambiguous since they fail to specifically define the term "community" concerning the specific sorts of communities that are granted priority privileges in tourism management. It can be inferred that several inhabitants comprise the local community within a region that can attract tourists. When considering the long-term vision for tourism development in Indonesia, the primary objective is to ensure equitable distribution of benefits, self-sufficiency, and improved well-being for the country, focusing on addressing the needs of the underprivileged population (Moh Fadli, Airin Liemanto, and Zainal Arifien, 2018).

Pro-poor tourism seeks to examine and enhance the tourism potential within impoverished areas to generate economic advancement through utilizing natural resources and preserving traditional culture. The viewpoint above aligns with the conceptualization of pro-poor tourism. It posits that it encompasses a comprehensive approach to generate favorable overall outcomes for marginalized populations rather than being limited to specific tourism products or industries. Pro-poor tourism policies aim to facilitate economic advancement, enhance livelihood opportunities, and promote inclusive involvement in decision-making processes for individuals experiencing poverty rather than solely focusing on expanding the tourism sector (Martin Mowforth and Ian Munt, 2016).

The sustainable tourism sector aims to promote the support of indigenous peoples, with the additional objective of fostering tourists' appreciation for indigenous communities as hosts of tourism destinations. Due to this inclination, destinations encounter interconnected sustainability issues stemming from visitor behavior that fails to engage with host communities or natural environments (Monica Adele Breiby et al., 2020). An engaged and empathetic understanding of the circumstances faced by indigenous communities and their ecological surroundings can effectively foster a profound appreciation for the natural environment and the preservation of community traditions. The preservation and sustainability of the community's natural environment and cultural traditions shall be ensured. In the context of tourism, customary law communities are commonly referred to as local citizens, who assume the role of managers or hosts at tourist attractions. The convergence of natural resources, visitors, and indigenous people necessitates the reinforcement and empowerment of legal frameworks in response to the growing demands of the tourism industry (Wacław Zyzak, 2015).

# Conclusion

The Padangtegal traditional village has successfully achieved independence in managing its prominent tourist attraction, Monkey Forest Ubud. Padangetegal Traditional Village effectively manages Monkey Forest Ubud by adhering to the philosophical underpinnings of THK. This approach aligns with the ideals of sustainable tourism, which prioritize enhancing the local community's economic well-being, preserving the natural environment, and safeguarding cultural traditions. The implementation of the SPKBB regional regulation in the Province of Bali serves as a means of empowering customary law villages to participate in the tourism industry effectively. The Padangtegal Customary Village has successfully shown this initiative. The aspiration is for all customary law communities in Indonesia to emulate the success of Padangtegal Customary Village as a paradigmatic example in effectively harnessing the tourism opportunities within their respective customary village domains.

# References

A.C. Bhaktivedanta Swami Prabhupada. (2007). *Bhagavad Gita Menurut Aslinya* (p. 224). Hanuman Sakti.

Badan Pusat Statistik Kabupaten Gianyar. (2023). *Statistik Daerah Kabupaten Gianyar*.

Gianyar.

Breiby, M. A., Duedahl, E., Øian, H., & Ericsson, B. (2020). Exploring sustainable experiences in tourism. *Scandinavian Journal of Hospitality and Tourism*, 20(4), 335–351. <http://doi.org/10.1080/15022250.2020.1748706>

Dana Yasa, P. (2022). Tri Hita Karana (Sekilas Historis Dan Hakikat Keharmonisan Semesta). *Sphatika: Jurnal Teologi*, 13(2), 205–216. Retrieved from http://ojs.uhnsugriwa.ac.id/index.php/Sphatika/article/view[/2214%0Ahttp://ojs.uhn](http://ojs.uhn/) sugriwa.ac.id/index.php/Sphatika/article/download/2214/1434

Fadli, M., Liemanto, A., & Arifien, Z. (2018). Re-actualising the potential of temples in Greater Malang as a new tourist attraction in Indonesia: The need to transform regulations into digitalised and integrated management. *Geojournal of Tourism and Geosites*, 25(2), 474–484. <http://doi.org/10.30892/gtg.25216-374>

Fadli, M., Susilo, E., Puspitawati, D., Ridjal, A. M., Maharani, D. P., & Liemanto, A. (2022). Sustainable Tourism as a Development Strategy in Indonesia. *Journal of Indonesian Tourism and Development Studies*, 10(1), 23–33. <http://doi.org/10.21776/ub.jitode.2022.010.01.04>

Fadli, M., Widiarto, A. E., Puspitawati, D., Maharani, D. P., Liemanto, A., Arifien, Z., & Supriyadi, R. F. (2021). The legal construction of spirituality, ethical and sustainable tourism of Temples in Malang raya, Indonesia. *Geojournal of Tourism and Geosites*, 35(2), 515–524. <http://doi.org/10.30892/GTG.35232-679>

I Made Parmita. (2023). *Wawancara Dengan Bendesa Adat Padangtegal*. Gianyar. Indonesia, M. P. dan E. K. B. P. dan E. K. R. Peraturan Menteri Pariwisata dan Ekonomi.

Kreatif/Kepala Badan Pariwisata dan Ekonomi Kreatif Republik Indonesia Nomor 9 Tahun (2021). Tentang Pedoman Destinasi Pariwisata Berkelanjutan.

Indonesia, R. (2009). Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 10 Tahun 2009 Tentang Kepariwisataan. Negara Republik Indonesia 59.

Isharyanto, Madalina, M., & S.K, A. T. (2019). *Hukum Kepariwisataan & Negara Kesejahteraan*. Bogor: Moeka Publishing.

Jan Hendrik Peters & Wisnu Wardana. (2013). Tri Hita Karana The Spirit of Bali. In *Tri Hita Karana The Spirit of Bali* (p. 81). Jakarta: PT Gramedia.

Mahagangga, I. W. R. S. dan I. G. A. O. (2014). Bentuk Kontribusi Daya Tarik Wisata Monkey di Desa Padang Tegal Kecamatan Ubud. *Jurnal Destinasi Pariwisata*, 2(2), 13–28.

Mendoza, I.; Rivera, M., & Doumet, Y. (2022). Políticas públicas ambientales y desarrollo turístico sostenible en las áreas protegidas de Ecuador. *Revista de estudios andaluces*, 43, 106-124. https://dx.doi.org/10.12795/rea.2022.i43.06

Miller, G., & Torres-Delgado, A. (2023). Measuring sustainable tourism: a state of the art review of sustainable tourism indicators. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 31(7), 1483–1496. <http://doi.org/10.1080/09669582.2023.2213859>

Moh Fadli, Jazim Hamidi, M. L. (2022). Sustainable Tourism as a Development Strategy in Indonesia. *Journal of Indonesian Tourism and Development Studies*, 10 (1), 23–33. Doi:10.21776/ub.jitode.2022.010.01.04

Monkey Forest Ubud. (2023). *History Origins and Evolution of Monkey Forest Ubud*.

<https://monkeyforestubud.com/about-us/>

Mowforth, M., & Munt, I. (2016). *Tourism and Sustainability.* New York: Routledge. <http://doi.org/10.4324/9781315795348>

Mulero Mendigorri, A., & Rivera Mateos, M. (2018). Turismo de naturaleza y espacios naturales protegidos en España. *Abaco: Revista de cultura y ciencias sociales*, 98 (Ejemplar dedicado a: El turismo. Desarrollo, transformación y controversia de un fenómeno social), 84-96.

Nurjaya, I. N. (2022). *Hukum Tata Kelola Kepariwisataan Nasional Berkelanjutan Alam dan Budaya Berbasis Masyarakat Hukum Adat. Hukum Tata Kelola Kepariwisataan Nasional Berkelanjutan Alam dan Budaya Berbasis Masyarakat Hukum Adat*. Malang: Inteligensia Media.

Rivera Mateos, M., & Mendoza Montesdeoca, I. (2022). La percepción de los visitantes sobre la gestión sostenible del turismo en destinos de naturaleza: Estudio de caso en el parque nacional Galápagos (Ecuador). *Cuadernos de turismo*, 50, 355-380. https://doi.org/10.6018/turismo.542011

Suarinastuti, I. A., & Mahagangga, I. G. A. O. (2016). Pengelolaan Sampah Di Daya Tarik Wisata Wanara Wana/ Monkey Forest, Desa Padangtegal, Ubud. Jurnal Destinasi Pariwisata, 4(2), 25. <http://doi.org/10.24843/jdepar.2016.v04.i02.p05>

Undang-Undang (2014). *Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 6 Tahun 2014 Tentang Desa.* Republik Indonesia 1–103 (2014). Indonesia. <http://doi.org/10.1145/2904081.2904088>

UNWTO. *Manila Declaration on World Tourism, The World Tourism Conference 4* (1980). United Nation. Retrieved from http://www.e- unwto.org/doi/pdf/10.18111/unwtodeclarations.1980.6.4.1

UNWTO (2020). *Global Code of Ethics for Tourism.* Madrid: UNWTO.

Wayan P. Windia. (2023). Mengenal Hukum Adat Bali. Bali: Pustaka Ekspresi.

Widiari, N. K. A. S., Widiati, I. A. P., & Suryani, L. P. (2022). Pelaksanaan Pengelolaan Objek Wisata Mandala Suci. Jurnal Preferensi Hukum, 3(1), 223–228.

World Toursm Organization. (n.d.). Sustainable Development. Retrieved from https:/[/www.unwto.org/sustainable-development](http://www.unwto.org/sustainable-development)

Zyzak, W. (2015). Sustainable Tourism - Sensible Tourism. *Chemistry-Didactics- Ecology-Metrology*, 20(1–2), 105–112. <http://doi.org/10.1515/cdem-2015-0011>

1. Universitas Pendidikan Nasional. Despasar, Bali (Indonesia). Email: [krisnaprasada@undiknas.ac.id](mailto:krisnaprasada@undiknas.ac.id) Id. Orcid: <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5728-5375> [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. Univesitas Brawijaya. Fakultas Hukum, Jawa Timur (Indonesia). Email: [inyoman@ub.ac.id](mailto:inyoman@ub.ac.id) Id. Orcid: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2000-3036> [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. Gadjah Mada University. Yogyakarta (Indonesia). Email: [rachmi.sulistya@ub.ac.id](mailto:rachmi.sulistya@ub.ac.id) Id. Orcid: <https://orcid.org/0009-0006-1241-7542> [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. University of Brawijaya. Fakultas Hukum, Jawa Timur (Indonesia). Email: [muktiono@ub.ac.id](mailto:muktiono@ub.ac.id) Id. Orcid: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7459-9744> [↑](#footnote-ref-4)